June 4, 2009

David W. Pershing  
Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs  
205 Park Building  
Campus

RE: Graduate Council Review  
School of Music

Dear Vice President Pershing:

Enclosed is the Graduate Council's review of the School of Music. Included in this review packet are the report prepared by the Graduate Council, the Academic Profile, and the Memorandum of Understanding resulting from the review wrap-up meeting.

Please forward this review to the Academic Senate to be placed on the information calendar for the next meeting of the Senate.

Sincerely,

David S. Chapman  
Associate Vice President for Graduate Studies  
Dean, The Graduate School

Encl.

XC: Robert Walzel, Director, School of Music  
Raymond Tymas-Jones, Dean, College of Fine Arts
The Graduate Council has completed its review of the School of Music.

External Review Committee:

    Dr. John Schaffer, Chair  
    Professor and Director  
    School of Music, University of Wisconsin-Madison

    Dr. Tayloe Harding  
    Professor and Dean  
    School of Music, University of South Carolina

    Dr. John Miller  
    Professor  
    Music Department, North Dakota State University

Internal Review Committee:

    Dr. Robert Johnson, Chair  
    Professor Emeritus  
    Department of Computing

    Dr. Joyce Mitchell  
    Professor and Chair  
    Department of Biomedical Informatics

    Dr. Cynthia Berg  
    Professor  
    Department of Psychology

This report of the Graduate Council is based on the self-study report submitted by the School of Music, the reports of the external and internal review committees, and the responses to those reports from the Director of the School of Music and Dean of the College of Fine Arts.
DEPARTMENT PROFILE

Program Overview

To reflect the comprehensive structure of programs offered by the Department, the University renamed the Music Department the School of Music in 2002. The School resides in the College of Fine Arts and offers an undergraduate BA in Music and four graduate degrees: Master of Music, MA in Musicology, PhD and Doctorate of Musical Arts (DMA). The school’s four-fold mission to “promote the art of music” is: 1) to train professionally-oriented students; 2) to further the reputation of the School and serve the art of music; 3) to provide a core of general and diverse music courses and experiences for students; and 4) as the State’s flagship institution to function as a center of cultural activity serving various communities. The School of Music is accredited by the National Association of Schools of Music.

Much has been accomplished since the last Graduate Council review and the current Director enjoys widespread support and appears to be doing an exceptional job. However, there exist several issues relating to governance structure and faculty lines that exist that may play a role in hindering the School from attaining its objectives.

Faculty

There are 25 full-time tenure-track faculty in the School of Music distributed evenly across the professorial ranks (40% are women and 12% are minority). In addition, there are 64 non tenure-track faculty (70% part-time). Interaction with the Utah Symphony in the use of adjunct faculty members is valuable. All full-time faculty have advanced degrees and demonstrate productivity in research, creative work or performance in their respective area of specialty. Although all the significant areas of music study are covered, if the School is to meet its aspirations to achieve a "national standard of excellence", it will likely require a greater number of full-time faculty members. Increased visibility of the existing faculty on the national field would play a significant role in attracting high caliber students and faculty to the School.

Faculty members have substantial service and teaching loads. Particularly, the Associate Director is given significantly less load-release time than the position warrants. Faculty members receive high ratings on course evaluations and 8 faculty have been recognized for excellence in teaching by external entities.

As a whole, morale seems high, and faculty members work effectively with students and towards the mission of the department. However, there are concerns regarding a lack of collective voice within the faculty governance structure and faculty salaries that are considerably lower than at peer institutions.
**Students**

Over the past 6 years, the School has enrolled an average of 368 undergraduate and 70 graduate students per year. Although the external review notes an excellent gender mix and a careful perusal of the >200 currently enrolled graduate students tabulated in the self-study indicates a sex-ratio close to 50:50, a summary should have been provided to aid evaluation. The external review and self-study report that the School experiences challenges recruiting minority students. However, the graduate council finds it difficult to evaluate these statements because the self-study does not provide any summary of the number of minority students enrolled and offers no policy to address this lack of diversity.

The School of Music actively recruits students in order to populate a critical mass of students in an array of complimenting instrumental and vocal performing classifications. In this respect, the School has been consistently successful in attracting students that provide a broad spectrum of instrumental and vocal talents.

The quality of graduate students entering the School is high (average undergraduate GPA for entering graduates is 3.5). The standards for the admission of both graduates and undergraduates are consistent with national norms. Student morale is high and students were generally pleased with the program and the quality of facilities.

The school currently supports 38 graduate students as teaching or graduate assistants. For attracting graduate students from beyond the typical state and regional locations, it will likely be necessary to have additional assistantship positions and travel scholarships for the extensive travel requirements of students for festivals and competitions where they can gain exposure at the national level.

**Curriculum and Programs of Study**

The School of Music offers a Bachelor of Music degree and a BA in music at the undergraduate level. At the graduate level the School offers the Master of Music degree, a MA in Musicology, a Doctorate of Musical Arts and Ph.D. degrees in music composition and music education. A full range of well structured, comprehensive, undergraduate and graduate degree courses are offered which are reflective of national standards and trends. With the significant use of adjunct faculty, the School maintains a pool of qualified faculty and graduate assistants to sustain the course offerings necessary to insure timely completion of all the degrees currently being offered. The School also provides opportunities for students to interact with professional faculty and major concert artists through periodic master classes. All exams required of graduate students meet national standards of scope and expectation and are consistent and well executed.

Serious concerns were raised with respect to the rigor of the dissertation requirement for the Ph.D. in Composition that need to be addressed. Other issues include
the lack of coordination between the musicianship and requisite written theory courses and the higher than average student to faculty ratio.

**Programs Effectiveness –Outcomes Assessment**

Assessment activities are integrated fully into the curriculum and activities and a variety of assessment tools are used to measure the effectiveness of its programs. These include rigorous music-entrance requirements (i.e., a competency-based audition), jury examinations at the end of each semester for those receiving private instruction, course evaluations, exit surveys for graduating students, and the monitoring of program quality and requirements by the standing Graduate and Undergraduate Studies Committees.

Data from student exit surveys suggests that students view their experience in the School of Music to be of good quality. Location and overall program quality were the most significant factors students’ decision to attend. Academic courses received high evaluations and private lesson experiences were reported as the most valuable component of the programs.

**Facilities and Resources**

The School of Music enjoys newly remodeled facilities, many of which are among the finest in the country. The equipment, the rooms in which the equipment is housed, and the condition and abundance of proper spaces for music study are excellent. The exceptions are the classrooms in the West Institute, the acoustics of the instrumental rehearsal hall, and an inadequate number of practice rooms. The music library is well managed, organized and highly utilized.

The overall administrative structure of the School appears to be well organized, efficient, and effective. However, the Assistant to the Director and the Undergraduate Administrative Assistant are severely over-stretched and the School lacks a dedicated media relations position. However, the School of Music continues to struggle with low faculty and staff salaries, student and opera funding.

**COMMENDATIONS**

1. The School of Music faculty exhibit very high levels of artistic and academic achievement and standards. They are well trained, productive and enthusiastic. Overall they are judged as excellent teachers and mentors by the students.

2. The student body is of a very high caliber, demonstrating highly-musical skills with a collectively strong desire for achieving academic and artistic excellence.

3. With few exceptions, the School of Music enjoys high quality facilities.
4. The School of Music has expanded its vision and program (recent additions are a program in jazz and the DMA) and maintains a high level of academic and artistic rigor in most degree programs being offered.

5. The Director is a strong leader and has done an excellent job in redirecting the School towards its new vision and goals. The School has high visibility in the local community and has raised their national visibility since the last review. Dr. Walzel should be commended for his efforts and success in moving the School into full accreditation status after a large number of years of probationary status.

6. The relationship and interaction between the School of Music and the Utah Symphony are positive and beneficial to the program.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **Governance.** The governance structure for the School should be reviewed for improvements. Issues that should be considered include: formation of a steering committee; restructuring of the Advisory Council to allow for direct faculty representation; and more clearly articulated procedures for the participation and supervision of the large non-regular/auxiliary faculty. Discussions with the Office of Faculty Development may be helpful to explore more inclusive governance structures.

2. **Student Diversity.** The Graduate School procedures requires: "department efforts to recruit minority students and to achieve appropriate diversity among your student body." It is not clear that such efforts are being made. The School of Music should formulate and implement efforts to recruit minority students and to achieve appropriate diversity among its enrolled student body. The Office of the Associate Vice President for Diversity is committed to this goal and may provide useful ideas and strategies in this regard. The use of annual progress reports to the Graduate Council should be considered as a way to encourage the School to work effectively towards this goal.

3. **Faculty Salaries and Merit Pay.** The Director, Dean and senior administration should develop a plan to address low faculty salaries. The determination of merit pay should be restructured to better align with promotion, retention and tenure priorities. In particular, research and professional service should play a greater role. Increasing the profile of these factors in merit determination will also help develop and maintain stronger national/regional levels of visibility.

4. **Faculty Lines.** There is a need to increase the number of regular faculty lines in the School of Music to alleviate the high ratio of adjunct to tenure line faculty. Converting some of the current lecturer tracks lines into regular faculty lines may be appropriate.
5. **Staff Support.** Increasing staff support is needed. Provisions should be made to simultaneously accommodate support for the Associate Director to allow for a higher release time and alleviate excessive workloads for senior staff.

6. **Curriculum/Program Revisions.** Two issues need attention. The requirements for the Ph.D. in Composition should be reviewed, with particular attention to concern of the lack of academic rigor associated with the final project. The lack of coordination of the theory and musicianship course content in the basic musicianship courses should be addressed.

7. **Facilities.** In contrast to the high quality facilities in the School in general, the practice rooms are too few and of poor condition. More sophisticated procedures for room scheduling may alleviate the problem to some extent. The possibility for additional appropriate space should be considered.

Submitted by the Ad Hoc Review Committee of the Graduate Council:

Nicola Camp (Chair), Biomedical Informatics  
John Martinez, Law  
Pat Murphy, Nursing
Memorandum of Understanding
School of Music

This memorandum of understanding is a summary of decisions reached at a wrap-up meeting on 22 May 2008, concluding the Graduate Council Review of the School of Music. David W. Pershing, Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs; Raymond Tymas-Jones, Dean of the College of Fine Arts; Robert Walzel, Director of the School of Music; David S. Chapman, Dean of the Graduate School; and Frederick Rhodewalt, Associate Dean of the Graduate School were present.

The discussion centered on but was not limited to the recommendations contained in the Graduate Council review completed on 28 April 2008. At the wrap-up meeting, the working group agreed to endorse the following actions:

**Recommendation 1: Governance.** The governance structure for the School should be reviewed for improvements. Issues that should be considered include: formation of a steering committee; restructuring of the Advisory Council to allow for direct faculty representation; and more clearly articulated procedures for the participation and supervision of the large non-regular/auxiliary faculty. Discussions with the Office of Faculty Development may be helpful to explore more inclusive governance structures.

In 2007, the School of Music developed and implemented a new policy detailing the representative faculty governance structure that has been practiced for many years. This policy will be reviewed and revised to allow adjunct faculty participation/representation on the departmental Advisory Committee. The Graduate School will explore the demand for a workshop dealing with issues related to adjunct faculty.

**Recommendation 2: Student Diversity.** The Graduate School procedures require "department efforts to recruit minority students and to achieve appropriate diversity among your student body." It is not clear that such efforts are being made. The School of Music should formulate and implement efforts to recruit minority students and to achieve appropriate diversity among its enrolled student body. The Office of the Associate Vice President for Diversity is committed to this goal and may provide useful ideas and strategies in this regard. The use of annual progress reports to the Graduate Council should be considered as a way to encourage the School to work effectively towards this goal.

The School of Music will work with Academic Outreach to identify and recruit minority students. In addition, the School of Music will conduct outreach efforts to arts high schools outside the state of Utah. The Dean of Fine Arts will encourage units with a successful history of minority recruiting to share strategies with other academic units within the College of Fine Arts.
Recommendation 3: Faculty Salaries and Merit Pay. The Director, Dean and senior administration should develop a plan to address low faculty salaries. The determination of merit pay should be restructured to better align with promotion, retention, and tenure priorities. In particular, research and professional service should play a greater role. Increasing the profile of these factors in merit determination will also help develop and maintain stronger national/regional levels of visibility.

The School of Music has developed a merit policy to reward faculty productivity. The proposed algorithm allows flexibility by weighting teaching 50-60%, research 25-40%, and service 10-20%. However, the Dean of Fine Arts has instructed the School of Music to reconsider the algorithm to more appropriately reward achievement in research and scholarship. The Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs will work with the Dean of Fine Arts to improve faculty salaries in the School of Music.

Recommendation 4: Faculty Lines. There is a need to increase the number of regular faculty lines in the School of Music to alleviate the high ratio of adjunct to tenure line faculty. Converting some of the current lecturer tracks lines into regular faculty lines may be appropriate.

The School of Music expects to convert one lecture line to a tenure-track faculty line. The Dean of Fine Arts and the Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs will attempt to obtain funds for additional FTE.

Recommendation 5: Staff Support. Increasing staff support is needed. Provisions should be made to simultaneously accommodate support for the Associate Director to allow for a higher release time and alleviate excessive workloads for senior staff.

It is agreed that current staff are overworked. The Dean and Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs will work to provide additional staff support.

Recommendation 6: Curriculum/Program Revisions. Two issues need attention. The requirements for the Ph.D. in Composition should be reviewed, with particular attention to concern of the lack of academic rigor associated with the final project. The lack of coordination of the theory and musicianship course content in the basic musicianship courses should be addressed.

The School of Music reports that the recommendation for revision of the Ph.D. in composition to increase its rigor was a misunderstanding by reviewers concerning the elements of the present program. The School of Music will consider ways to better coordinate theory and musicianship course content in the basic musicianship courses.
Recommendation 7: *Facilities.* In contrast to the high quality facilities in the School in general, the practice rooms are too few and of poor condition. More sophisticated procedures for room scheduling may alleviate the problem to some extent. The possibility for additional appropriate space should be considered.

The School of Music plans to convert space in the West Institute, which is soon to be vacated by the Department of Theatre, into additional practice rooms. The School of Music will work to develop more efficient practice room scheduling procedures.

This memorandum of understanding is to be followed by annual letters of progress from the Chair of the Department to the Dean of the Graduate School. Letters will be submitted each year until all of the actions in the preceding paragraphs have been completed.

David W. Pershing
Raymond Tymas-Jones
Robert Walzel
David S. Chapman
Frederick Rhodewalt

David S. Chapman
Associate VP for Graduate Studies
Dean, The Graduate School
June 4, 2009